Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20554

D	N	:K	FT	FII	F	CO	Pγ	OF	RIG	INAL
~	v	J.		1 11	-1-	\mathbf{v}		u	111	けんソア

In The Matter of)	
)	
Federal-State Joint Board on)	CC Docket No. 96-45
Universal Service)	

COMMENTS OF SBC COMMUNICATIONS INC.

SBC Communications Inc., on its behalf and on behalf of its subsidiaries (collectively referred to as "SBC"), respectfully recommends that the Commission postpone reconsideration of the definition of "voice grade access" until such can be appropriately reviewed in the context of the redefinition of "universal service." If the Commission wishes to address this issue at this time, it must reject the attempts to expand the definition of voice grade access beyond the well-reasoned standard currently codified. The redefinition of "voice grade access" requested on the part of certain state commissions and the Rural Utilities Service (RUS) is nothing more than an attempt to expand the definition of universal service beyond voice grade. The goals of the Telecommunications Act of 1996 and the needs of consumers are best served by the continued implementation of the Commission's current universal service rules.

As noted in the Public Notice, an eligible telecommunications carrier (ETC) must offer, in addition to other services, voice grade access to the public switched network.

CC Docket No. 96-45 Communications Inc. January 19, 2000

Confidential & Privileged

ATTORNEY-CLIENT COMMUNICATION, ATTORNEY WORK PRODUCT
PREPARED BY COUNSEL IN CONNECTION WITH OR IN ANTICIPATION OF LITIGATION
REGULATORY ACTION OR PROCEEDINGS, AND/OR INVOLVING LEGISLATIVE ACTIVITY

No. of Copies rec'd O

¹ The Commission in its Public Notice in this proceeding, released on December 22, 1999, sought comments and reply comments in response to Petitions for Reconsideration filed by the North Dakota Public Service Commission and the South Dakota Public Utilities Commission, the *Ex Parte* filed by the Rural Utilities Service and the Resolution on Definition of Voice Grade Service for Universal Service Purposes, adopted by the National Association of Regulatory Utility Commissioners, on March 18, 1998.

After a lengthy proceeding, culminating in the *Fourth Reconsideration Order*² a minimum frequency range of 300 Hz to 3,000 Hz for the bandwidth of voice grade access was established. The RUS and certain state commissions now seek a minimum frequency range of 200 Hz or 300 Hz to 3,400 Hz or 3,500 Hz. The sole reason given for broadening the bandwidth is the concern that the current requirement may not ensure that rural consumers using 28.8 kilobits per second modems to access the Internet will be able to achieve the same data transmission speeds as non-rural consumers.

The expansion proposed is not an insignificant one with little consequence for ETCs. Nor is it an issue relating only to large carriers. In fact, the adverse impact will be far greater for smaller, start-up carriers with limited resources for the result of the change being proposed would be to expand the definition of the services covered as a part of universal service. Moreover, the consequence of such action would be to impose millions of dollars in costs upon ETCs, placing a tremendous and unnecessary burden on universal service requirements. For example, recently in Wisconsin, the Public Service Commission investigated mandating a 28.8 kilobits per second modem speed throughout the state. The total cost of such an endeavor would have been approximately \$668 million. The costs which would result from the instant proposal before the FCC would greatly exceed this simple statewide estimate and be beyond any reasonable expenditure.

An obvious, additional consequence would be that fewer carriers will seek to remain or become ETCs, particularly if the limited support they receive under the federal fund is overshadowed by the costs imposed. Alternatively, these costs associated with upgrading the existing and potential ETCs' networks, if recoverable, would significantly

- 2 -

² Federal-State Joint Board on Universal Service, Access Charge Reform, Price Cap Performance Review for Local Exchange Carriers, Transport Rate Structure and Pricing, End User Common Line Charge, Fourth Order on Reconsideration, CC Docket No. 96-45, 96-262, 94-1, 91-213, 95-72, 13 FCC Rcd 5318 (1997).

impact universal service funding. In this respect, the proposal not only would fail to preserve and advance universal service, it would act in a manner contrary to this goal.

Conclusion

If the Commission believes the expansion of voice grade access should be explored, then it is an issue more appropriately addressed in the context of the review of the definition of universal service as already contemplated by the Act and the Commission. If the Commission wishes to consider this issue at this time, it should maintain its current standard.

Respectfully submitted,

SBC COMMUNICATIONS INC.

By: /s/ Hope Thurrott
Alfred G. Richter, Jr.
Roger K. Toppins
Hope Thurrott
One Bell Plaza, Room 3203
Dallas, Texas 75202
214-464-3620

Attorneys for SBC Communications Inc. and its Subsidiaries

January 19, 2000

- 3 -

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

On this 19th day of January 2000, I, Mary Ann Morris, hereby certify that the Comments for SBC Communications Inc. in CC Docket No. 96-45 have been served upon the parties listed in the Service List attached to the Comments for SBC Communications, Inc.

/s/ Mary Ann Morris

January 19, 2000

MAGALIE ROMAN SALAS SECRETARY FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION 445 12TH STREET, SW, ROOM TW-B204F WASHINGTON, D.C. 20554 INTERNATIONAL TRANSCRIPTION SERVICE 1231 20TH ST NW WASHINGTON DC 20036

SHERYL TODD
ACCOUNTING POLICY DIVISION
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
THE PORTALS
445 12TH STREET SW
WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE SUSAN NESS CHAIR COMMISSIONER FEDERAL COMMUNICATION COMMISSION THE PORTALS 445 12TH STREET SW WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE HAROLD FURCHTGOTT-ROTH COMMISSIONER FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION THE PORTALS 445 12TH STREET SW WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE WILLIAM E KENNARD, CHAIRMAN FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION THE PORTALS 445 12TH STREET SW WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL K POWELL COMMISSIONER FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION THE PORTALS 445 12TH STREET SW WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE GLORIA TRISTANI
COMMISSIONER
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
THE PORTALS
445 12TH STREET SW
WASHINGTON DC 20554

THE HONORABLE LASKA SCHOENFELDER COMMISSIONER SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION STATE CAPITOL 500 EAST CAPITOL STREET PIERRE SD 57501-5070 THE HONORABLE PATRICK H WOOD III CHAIRMAN TEXAS PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION 1701 NORTH CONGRESS AVE AUSTIN TX 78701

MARTHA S HOGERTY MISSOURI OFFICE OF PUBLIC COUNCIL 301 WEST HIGH STREET STE 250 TRUMAN BUILDING JEFFERSON CITY MO 65102 DEONNE BRUNING NEBRASKA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION 300 THE ATRIUM 1200 N STREET P O BOX 94927 LINCON NE 68509-4927

CHARLES BOLLE SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION STATE CAPITOL 500 EAST CAPITOL ST PIERRE SD 57501-5070 JAMES CASSERLY
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMISSIONER NESS'S OFFICE
THE PORTALS
445 12TH STREET SW
WASHINGTON DC 20554

ROWLAND CURRY TEXAS PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION 1701 NORTH CONGRESS AVENUE P O BOX 13326 AUSTIN TX 78701 ANN DEAN
MARYLAND SERVICE PUBLIC COMMISSION
16TH FLOOR 6 SAINT PAUL STREET
BALTIMORE MD 21202-6806

STATE STAFF CHAIR FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION 2540 SHUMARD OAK BLVD. TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-0866 IRENE FLANNERY
FEDERAL STAFF CHAIR
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
ACCOUNTING AND AUDITS DIVISION
UNIVERSAL SERVICE BRANCH
THE PORTALS
445 12TH STREET SW
WASHINGTON DC 20554

PAUL GALLANT
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMISSIONER TRISTANI'S OFFICE
THE PORTALS
445 12TH STREET SW
WASHINGTON DC 20554

LORI KENYON ALASKA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION 1016 WEST SIXTH AVENUE STE 400 ANCHORAGE AK 99501

MARK LONG FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION 2540 SHUMARD OAK BLVD. TALLAHASSEE FL 32399-0866 SANDRA MAKEEF IOWA UTILITIES BOARD LUCAS STATE OFFICE BUILDING DES MOINES IA 50319

KEVIN MARTIN
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
COMMISSIONER FURCHTGOTT-ROTH'S OFFICE
THE PORTALS
445 12TH STREET SW
WASHINGTON DC 20554

PHILIP F MCCLELLAND
PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE OF CONSUMER
ADVOCATE
1425 STRAWBERRY SQUARE
HARRISBURG PA 17120

BARRY PAYNE
INDIANA OFFICE OF THE CONSUMER COUNSEL
100 NORTH SENATE AVE ROOM N501
INDIANAPOLIS IN 46204-2208

CHARLES GRAY
JAMES B. RAMSAY
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF REGULATORY
UTILITY COMMISSIONERS
1100 PENNSYLVANIA AVE., N.W.
P.O. BOX 603
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20044-0684

BRIAN ROBERTS
CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94102

TIANE SOMMER GEORGIA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION 244 WASHINGTON ST SW ATLANTA GA 30334-5701

PAUL A BULLIS
CHIEF COUNSEL
MAUREEN A SCOTT
ARIZONA CORPORATION COMMISSION
1200 WEST WASHINGTON ST
PHOENIX AZ 85007

LAWRENCE W KATZ
MICHAEL E GLOVER
BELL ATLANTIC TELEPHONE COMPANIES
1320 NORTH COURT HOUSE ROAD
EIGHTH FLOOR
ARLINGTON VA 22201

JOEL B SHIFMAN, ESQ MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION 242 STATE STREET 18 STATE HOUSE STATION AUGUSTA MAINE 04333-0018 M ROBERT SUTHERLAND RICHARD M SBARATTA BELLSOUTH CORPORATION SUITE 1700 1155 PEACHTREE STREET NE ATLANTA GA 30309-3610 KENNETH T BURCHETT GVNW CONSULTING INC 8050 S. W. WARM SPRINGS STREET SUITE 200 TUALATIN OREGON 97062 DOUGLAS D LEEDS AIRTOUCH COMMUNICATIONS INC ONE CALIFORNIA STREET 29TH FLOOR SAN FRANCISCO CA 94111

PAMELA J RILEY
AIRTOUCH COMMUNICATIONS INC
1818 N STREET
SUITE 800
WASHINGTON DC 20036

LAWRENCE E SARJEANT
LINDA L KENT
KEITH TOWNSEND
JOHN W HUNTER
JULIE RONES
UNITED STATES TELEPHONE ASSOCIATION
1401 H STREET NW
SUITE 600
WASHINGTON DC 20005

LAWRENCE E SARJEANT
LINDA L KENT
KEITH TOWNSEND
JOHN W HUNTER
JULIE L RONES
UNITED STATES TELECOM ASSOCIATION
1401 H STREET NW
SUITE 600
WASHINGTON DC 20005

MARK C ROSENBLUM STEPHEN C GARAVITO AT&T CORP 295 N MAPLE AVENUE ROOM 1131M1 BASKING RIDGE NJ 07920

DOUGLAS I BRADON AT&T WIRELESS SERVICES INC 1150 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW SUITE 400 WASHINGTON DC 20036 HOWARD J SYMONS SARA F SEIDMAN CHRISTOPHER H KALLAHER MINTZ LEVIN COHN FERRIS GLOVSKY & POPEO AT&T CORP 701 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW SUITE 900 WASHINGTON DC 20004 RONALD L RIPLEY
DOBSON COMMUNICATIONS CORPORATION
13439 N BROADWAY EXTENSION
SUITE 2000
OKLAHOMA CITY OK 73114

MARY MCDERMOTT TODD B LANTOR PERSONAL COMMUNICATIONS INDUSTRY ASSOCIATION 500 MONTGOMERY STREET SUITE 700 ALEXANDRIA VA 22314-1561

LOLITA D SMITH
MICHAEL F ALTSCHUL
RANDALL S COLEMAN
CELLULAR TELECOMMUNICATIONS
INDUSTRY ASSOCIATION
1250 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW
SUITE 800
WASHINGTON DC 20036

STEVEN R BECK US WEST COMMUNICATIONS INC 1020 19TH STREET NW SUITE 700 WASHINGTON DC 20036

ELIZABETH NOEL
SANDRA MATTAVOUS-FRYE
BARBARA BURTON
OFFICE OF THE PEOPLE'S COUNSEL
FOR THE DISTRIC OF COLUMBIA
1133 15TH STREET NW
SUITE 500
WASHINGTON DC 20005-2710

DAVID COSSON KRASKIN LESSE & COSSON LLP 2120 L STREET NW SUITE 520 WASHINGTON DC 20037

MARTIN JACOBSON MONTANA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION 1701 PROSPECT AVENUE PO BOX 202601 HELENA MONTANA 79620-2601 LORI C LEVIN AMSC SUBSIDIARY CORPORATION 1080 PARKRIDGE BOULEVARD RESTON VIRGINIA 22091 FAMELA J RILEY AIRTOUCH COMMUNICATIONS 1818 N STREET NW SUITE 800 WASHINGTON DC 20036 JEFFREY S LINDER KENNETH J KRISKO WILEY REIN & FIELDING GTE 1776 K STREET NW WASHINGTON DC 20006

GAIL L POLIVY GTE SERVICE CORP. 1850 M STREET NW SUITE 1200 WASHINGTON DC 20036 THOMAS R PARKER GTE SERVICE CORP 600 HIDDEN RIDGE MS HQ-E03JR43 PO BOX 152092 IRVING TX 75015-2092

KATE KAERCHER STUART POLIKOFF OPASTCO 21 DUPONT CIRCLE NW SUITE 700 WASHINGTON DC 20036 MARGOT SMILEY HUMPHREY KOTEEN & NAFTALIN LLP NRTA 1150 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW SUITE 1000 WASHINGTON DC 20036

MICHELE C FARQUHAR DAVID L SIERADZKI RONNIE JONDON HOGAN & HARTSON LLP WESTERN WIRELESS CORP 555 THIRTEENTH STREET NW WASHINGTON DC 20004-1109 GENE DEJORDY WESTERN WIRELESS CORP 3650 – 131ST AVE SE SUITE 400 BELLEVUE WA 98006 WALTER L CHALLENGER
PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE
UNITED STATES VIRGIN ISLANDS
PO BOX 40
CHARLOTTE AMALIE USVI 00804

GERARD J DUFFY BLOOSTON MORDKOFSKY JACKSON & DICKENS THE WESTERN ALLIANCE 2120 L STREET NW SUITE 300 WASHINGTON DC 20037

KAREN BRINKMANN
RICHARD R CAMERON
WILLIAM S CARNELL
LATHAM & WATKINS
CENTURYTEL INC
1001 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20004

JOHN F JONES CENTURYTEL INC 100 CENTURY PARK DRIVE MONROE LOUISIANA 71203

DAVID A LAFURIA B LYNN F RATNAVALE LUKAS NACE GUTIERREZ & SACHS CHARTERED SMITH BAGLEY INC 1111 19TH STREET NW SUITE 1200 WASHINGTON DC 20036 MARGOT SMILEY HUMPHREY KOTEEN & NAFTALIN LLP TDS TELECOMMUNICATIONS CORP 1150 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW SUITE 1000 WASHINGTON DC 20036

LAWRENCE E SARJEANT
LINDA L KENT
KEITH TOWNSEND
JOHN W HUNTER
JULIE RONES
UNITED STATES TELECOM ASSOCIATION
1401 H STREET NW
SUITE 600
WASHINGTON DC 20005

RICHARD A ASKOFF REGINA MCNEIL NATIONAL EXCHANGE CARRIER ASSOCIATION INC 80 SOUTH JEFFERSON ROAD WHIPPANY NY 07981 JIMMY JACKSON
GENERAL COMMUNICATION IN
2550 DENALI STREET
SUITE 1000
ANCHORAGE AK 99503

JOE D EDGE
TINA M PIDGEON
COURTNEY R EDEN
DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP
PUERTO RICO TELEPHONE COMPANY INC
1500 K STREET NW
SUITE 1100
WASHINGTON DC 20005

PHILIP L MALET
JAMES M TALENS
OMER C EYAL
STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP
MOTOROLA AND IRIDIUM NORTH AMERICA
1330 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20036

LAURA A LO BIANCO IRIDIUM NORTH AMERICA 8440S RIVER PARKWAY TEMPE AZ 85284

MICHAEL D KENNEDY BARRY LAMBERGMAN LEIGH M CHINITZ MOTORALA INC 1350 I STREET NW WASHINGTON DC 20005 JOHN T SCOTT III CROWELL & MORING LLP BELL ATLANTIC MOBILE INC 1001 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW WASHINGTON DC 20004

S MARK TULLER BELL ATLANTIC MOBILE INC 180 WASHINGTON VALLEY ROAD BEDMINSTER NJ 07921 PETER M CONNOLLY KOTEEN & NAFTALIN LLP UNITED STATES CELLULAR CORPORATION 1150 CONNECTICUT AVE NW WASHINGTON DC 20036 ROBERT M HALPERIN CROWELL & MORING LLP STATE OF ALASKA 1001 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW WASHINGTON DC 20004 JOHN W KATZ STATE OF ALASKA 444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET NW SUITE 336 WASHINGTON DC 20001

CHRISTOPHER A KARNS
DORSEY & WHITNEY LLP
TUSCARORA INDIAN NATION OF NEW YORK
1001 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
SUITE 300 SOUTH
WASHINGTON DC 20004

GUY CHRISTIANSEN SKYBRIDGE LLC 3 BETHESDA METRO CENTER SUITE 700 BETHESDA MD 20814

JEFFREY H OLSON LAURA B SHERMAN PAUL WEISS RIFKIND WHARTON & GARRISON 1615 L STREET NW SUITE 1300 WASHINGTON DC 200636 ROBERT A MAZER
ALBERT SHULDINER
VINSON & ELKINS LLP
1455 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20004-1008

L MARIE GUILLORY
DANIEL MITCHELL
NATIONAL TELEPHONE
COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION
4121 WILSON BOULEVARD 10TH FLOOR
ARLINGTON VA 22203

CHARLES H KENNEDY
JAMES A CASEY
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP
COUNSEL FOR SALT RIVER PIMA-MARICOPA
INDIAN COMMUNITY AND NATIONAL TRIBAL
TELECOMMUNICATIONS ALLIANCE
2000 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
SUITE 5500
WASHINGTON DC 20006

WILLIAM W QUINN SNELL & WILMER COUNSEL FOR SALT RIVER PIMA-MARICOPA INDAINA COMMUNITY ONE ARIZONA CENTER PHOENIX AZ 85004 JUDY SELLO MARK C ROSENBLUM AT&T CORP 295 NORTH MAPEL AVENUE ROOM 1135L2 BASKING RIDGE NEW JERSEY 07920

GENE C SCHAERR
JAMES P YOUNG
SIDLEY & AUSTIN
AT&T CORP
1722 EYE STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20006

CHUCK GOLDFARB MCI WORLDCOM INC 1801 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW WASHINGTON DC 20006

GREGORY VOGT
DANIEL J SMITH
JOSHUA S TURNER
WILEY REIN & FIELDING
VIRGIN ISLANDS TELEPHONE CORP
1776 K STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20006-2304

SAMUEL E EBBESEN VIRGIN ISLANDS TELEPHONE CORP PO BOX 6100 ST THOMAS USVI 00801-6100

PANTELIS ICHALOPOUL STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP TITAN WIRELESS 1220 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW WASHINGTON DC 20036 JAMES T TAYLOR TITAN WIRELESS 3033 SCIENCE PARKER ROAD SAN DIEGO CA 92121 BELINDA NELSON GIL RIVER TELECOMMUNICATIONS INC 7605 WEST ALLISON ROAD BOX 5015 CHANDLER AZ 85226 RICHARD D COIT SOUTH DAKOTA INDEPENDENT TELEPHONE COALITION INC 207 E CAPITOL AVE SUITE 206 PIERRE SD 57501

HEATHER H GRAHAME DORSEY & WHITNEY LLP ALASKA RURAL COALITION 1031 W 4TH AVENUE SUITE 600 ANCHORAGE ALASKA 99501 MICHELE C FARQUHAR
DAVID L SIERADZKI
RONNIE LONDON
HOGAN & HARTSON LLP
WESTERN WIRELESS CORPORATION
555 THIRTEENTH STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20004-1109

GENE DEJORDY WESTERN WIRELESS CORP 3650 – 131ST AVE SE SUITE 400 BELLEVUE WA 98006 JOSEPH DIBELLA
BELL ATLANTIC
1320 NORTH COURT HOUSE ROAD
EIGHTH FLOOR
ARLINGTON VA 22201

S MARK TULLER CELLCO PARTNERSHIP D/B/A BELL ATLANTIC MOBILE 180 WASHINGTON VALLEY ROAD BEDMINSTER NJ 07921 AGNES M ALEXANDER PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA 717 14TH STREET NW WASHINGTON DC 20005 I PAVID COSSON
STEVEN E WATKINS
KRASKIN LESSE & COSSON LLP
THE COALITION OF RURAL
TELEPHONE COMPANIES
2120 L STREET NW
SUITE 520
WASHINGTON DC 20037

ANNE LINTON
WASHINGTON FEDERAL STRATEGIES LLC
4601 NORTH PART AVENUE
SUITE 710
CHEVY CHASE MARYLAND 20815

PAUL J HICKEY HICKEY MACKEY EVANS WALKER & STEWART WESTERN WIRELESS 1712 CAREY AVENUE PO BOX 467 CHEYENNE WY 82003 WILLIAM P HEASTON
US WEST COMMUNICATIONS INC
1801 CALIFORNIA STREET
SUITE 5100
DENVER CO 80202

MARK BARNETT JOHN P GUHIN 300 E CAPITOL AVENUE PIERRE SD 57501-5070 NATHANIEL HAWTHORNE SPRING COVE SCHOOL DISTRICT 27600 CHAGRIN BLVD SUITE 260 CLEVELAND OH 44122